| **Student Name:** Jasmine Gao |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that criminal justice policy should be decided by technocrats rather than elected representatives |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 6 minutes’ long.]  In defense of the incentives of technocrats:   * It isn’t clear how technocrats integrate morality into their decisions, we should highlight that inhumane policies often lead to worse outcomes for criminal justice. Thus, humane policies and effectiveness are often aligned in incentives. * On greater polarisation, rather than focusing on the gridlock, this is in tension with the idea that populism or the lobbyist control the majority of politicians. It’d be better to explain how politicians often prop up discrimination because that is the popular sentiment of the people and how they receive corporate rewards.   + We eventually went to this outcome in the latter half, so the earlier response was in tension.   Rather than utilising this speech structure, we need to restructure everything to a team-by-team comparison from the start!  We are lacking a case framing here!   * Weigh for us as to why you believe effectiveness is the most important thing in the debate vs representation. OG never provided the framing here, so the credit will then go to CG.   + E.g. The goal that represents all voters is actually better law and order and less crimes, so the team that fulfills effectiveness is actually doing a better job at fulfilling the public mandate.   On experts being more qualified in making better policies:   * We need grounding on the failure of tough on crime laws because OG did not provide any!   + Illustrate a FEW examples of tough on crime laws, then mechanise specifically why those exact policies don’t work in the context of criminal justice.     - E.g. Poor funding of prisons actively dehumanise criminals which forces them to embrace their criminal identity, rather than view themselves as someone who can reintegrate. * Opp argued that politicians also have an incentive to pass effective policies, so explain why they don’t pass rehabilitative policies despite it being quite effective.   + I.e. These are resource-intensive policies which require a high amount of political capital! So this requires politicians to advocate for a voter group that has no political power at all. There’s no political returns for this policy. * Excellent reinforcement on lobbying/corporate capture that influences politicians into making terrible policies.   + Can we be more specific with the grounding? Expand the massive wealth of the prison industrial complex and how they levy that wealth for policies that fuel mass incarceration and prison overcrowding.   We are claiming that your extension solves a lot of the issues, but the execution always comes short of demonstrating precisely how.  Good job offering POIs today!  6.05 | | | | | | |